![JIRTE - Journal of Innovative Research in Teacher Education]

Analyzing 9th grade secondary school history textbook in Türkiye regarding historical ethics

İsmail Hakkı Demircioğlu[ID][1], **İnanç Genç**[ID][2], **and Selahattin Kaymakcı**[ID][3]

Abstract

Historical ethics is addressed in history textbooks in an integrative, multi-faceted, reflective, and topical way. This approach contributes to a more comprehensive understanding of the past and the development of students' critical evaluation skills. This study aims to comprehensively evaluate the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook in Türkiye from the perspective of historical ethics. Within the scope of qualitative methodology, document analysis was used in the study, and the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook published by the Ministry of National Education of the Republic of Türkiye was used as the data source. The "Form for Examining Textbooks in terms of Historical Ethics" developed by the researchers was used as a data collection tool. The textbook's content was analyzed in this framework regarding historical accuracy and honesty, cultural sensitivity and diversity, human rights and ethical values, critical approach and topicality, impartiality, and pluralism. The data collected within the scope of the research were analyzed by the content analysis method. The findings show that the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook complies with the principles of historical ethics to a great extent. However, it was concluded that some themes should be examined more deeply, and some aspects of the content should be enriched. It can be said that including more examples and discussions, especially in areas such as historical accuracy, cultural sensitivity, and human rights, will contribute to developing students' critical thinking skills.

Keywords: Historical Ethics, Historical thinking, History education, History Textbook

[1] Corresponding author, Trabzon University, Fatih Faculty of Education, Department of Turkish and Social Sciences Education, Türkiye, demircioglu61@yahoo.com
[2] Kastamonu University Institute of Social Sciences, Department of Turkish and Social Sciences Education, Türkiye, inancgenc@yahoo.com
[3] Kastamonu University, Faculty of Education, Department of Turkish and Social Sciences Education, Türkiye, selahattinkaymakci@gmail.com

INTRODUCTION

History has been a field of interest for human beings since the first civilizations as a reflection of human curiosity. History is a study of the past and means "research; knowledge acquired through inquiry." History is an umbrella concept that includes remembering, discovering, collecting, organizing, presenting, and interpreting information about past events and events (Arnold, 2000; Liddell & Scott, 1996). Accordingly, it is challenging to come up with an agreed definition of history. Moreover, the fact that history is a dynamic discipline makes it difficult for historians to agree on a single definition (Chang'ach, 2013).

As important as the whatness of history is, how historical thinking is realized is also an important issue. As it is known, historical thinking is a basic mental process used to understand, interpret, and adapt the past to the present. In this context, historical thinking is the creative process of historians to make sense of and interpret the past (Genç, 2023; Seixas & Morton, 2013). Historians try to understand and explain the relationship between the past and the present based on limited and fragmented historical evidence. This process is shaped by the combination of the historian's creativity and the traces of the past. Historical thinking may vary in different cultures and periods. The differences between written history and oral history can be given as an example. Writing history involves new challenges in today's complex and rapidly changing world. In order to overcome these challenges, historians specialize in academic training. They are also familiar with their peers' norms regarding the use of evidence, the validity of arguments, and the adequacy of causal explanations. However, these processes are often hidden at the end of historical narratives, so students must be familiar with the methods and techniques used by historians (Seixas & Morton, 2013). When students know these methods and techniques, they can evaluate historical evidence by understanding the historical thinking process. In this way, students gain historical literacy skills.

Although there are many models for historical thinking, one of the most widely accepted ones is Peter Seixas' Historical Thinking Skills model. For example, in Lomas' (1990) "Teaching and Assessing Historical Understanding", he explained key concepts such as cause and effect, continuity and change, evidence, and historical significance for teachers (Lomas, 1990). However, he did not mention the concepts of "historical empathy" and "ethical dimension", while Seixas included "historical perspective" and "ethical" dimension among the six types of historical thinking he proposed. In other words, while Seixas emphasizes historical ethics and empathy as an important component of historical thinking, these concepts are not included in Lomas' list. In this context, Peter Seixas created a model of six basic components supporting historical thinking skills. Seixas' studies on these concepts and the model he developed started to take shape in the mid-1990s (Denos, Case, & Seixas, 2023; Seixas, 1998; Seixas, 1997; Seixas, 1996).

Figure 1 Historical thinking skills model developed by Peter Seixas

As seen in Figure 1, one key concept in the model Seixas developed is historical ethics. As is known, historians try to understand the ethical dimension of destructive events such as conquests and slavery in the historical process. Accordingly, when we look at the past, it becomes inevitable to take an ethical attitude toward the destruction and injustices caused by such events. In this context, the victories and achievements of the past also require ethical judgment. These ethical judgments can be listed as follows;

- What price was paid for these victories and achievements?
- What were their consequences?
- How should we evaluate these events from today's perspective?

Historians and students need to carefully analyze and evaluate both positive and negative events to understand the ethical dimension of the past. In this way, they can understand the historical heritage that has passed from the past to the present and make more informed ethical decisions (Denos, Case, Seixas, & Clark, 2023). Historical ethics considers ethical principles when interpreting history or judging the past. This approach aims to evaluate the actions, aims, and intentions of individuals, groups, and societies involved in historical events fairly and objectively. In this context, historical ethics aims to understand the problems, dilemmas, and violations related to the past and to make more ethical decisions today. Historical ethical principles can illuminate current ethical issues (Seixas & Ercikan, 2015). "Human behavior" schemas such as morality and justice play an important role in students' understanding of historical texts, but this can also affect their critical reading skills (Levstik & Barton, 2011).

The content of historical ethics covers various elements. First, examining moral judgments, right/wrong, and good/bad concepts in history is important. For this reason, the ethical evaluation of the values, beliefs, and actions of people in the past is also included in this scope. In addition, serious human rights violations in history, such as genocide, slavery, and war crimes, are ethically analyzed. In addition, ethical analyses of historical actors' intentions, choices, and responsibilities are also an important part of the content. Finally, the development of contemporary perspectives on ethically sensitive issues of the past is among the topics that constitute the content of historical ethics. In this context, historical ethics aims to use the ethical criteria in these contents to understand and interpret the past. This approach provides a deeper and more comprehensive understanding of history and contributes to making more conscious and ethical decisions today (Seixas, 2017; Seixas & Ercikan, 2015). Indeed, human actions are inherently intertwined with ethical reasoning. In other words, people, consciously or unconsciously, evaluate every action ethically. Therefore, ethical reasoning is fundamental for understanding and explaining historical events. In this context, the ethical character of historical actions should not be restricted to judgments made afterward by looking at the results of those actions. Instead, it should also be analyzed what the actors, i.e., historical figures, who performed these actions intended their actions (Ahonen, 2023). In this context, the content of historical ethics includes the following basic elements:

Examination of moral judgments and concepts in the past: This element of historical ethics refers to considering the context and circumstances of people in the past. Moral approaches in the past are not "otherised", but rather tried to be understood and interpreted. This approach emphasizes two important points: First since time and circumstances change, a direct evaluation of past moral judgments and behaviors with present-day criteria can be misleading. Historical ethics emphasizes understanding and interpreting the past within its context. Secondly, approaching the past with empathy and understanding instead of "othering" provides a better understanding of moral approaches in the past. In this way, it is possible to better understand historical development and see the origins of today's moral values (Denos, Case, Seixas, & Clark, 2023; Ricoeur, 2004).

Ethical analysis of gross human rights violations: This element of historical ethics is an important component of the ethical scrutiny of gross human rights violations. The most horrific events in human history, such as genocide, slavery, and war crimes, are considered in this context. In this context, a historical ethics approach requires first analyzing the historical, political, and socio-cultural contexts of these events. The experiences of victims, the intentions and actions of perpetrators, and institutional and social dynamics are tried to be understood. The ethical wrongness and unacceptability of these practices are then emphasized. The dominant ethical understandings of the past are also discussed and compared with the ethical paradigm of today. In addition, the long-term effects and traumas of these violations on modern societies are also discussed from an ethical perspective (Seixas, 2017; Seixas & Ercikan, 2015; Torpey, 2006).

Analyzing the intentions, choices, and responsibilities of historical actors in an ethical context: This component of historical ethics analyses the ethical decisions and actions of important historical figures in the past. Historical ethics ethically evaluates the actions, decisions, and responsibilities of these individuals and institutions, taking into account the conditions and moral values of the time. Historical ethics interprets important past figures' moral attitudes and decisions by comparing them with today's ethical standards. Accordingly, this component contributes to understanding ethical values in history and the development of ethical thinking today. Thus, the ethical analysis of historical figures' intentions, choices, and responsibilities becomes one of the fundamental components of historical ethics. Historical ethics aims to illuminate the historical background of ethical development by analyzing the actions and decisions of important figures of the past from today's ethical perspective (Beverage & Lorenz, 2013; Jenkins, 2003).

Developing contemporary perspectives on ethically sensitive issues from the past: This component of historical ethics is directly related to historical perspective. An important historical perspective is determining the ethical boundaries between the past and present. Accordingly, ethical practices accepted in the past may gain a different meaning in light of today's values. Therefore, it is necessary to consider the conditions of the period and the social norms at that time. Judging the actions of historical actors from today's perspective creates a situation that is contrary to historical ethics. People's understanding of ethics may change in the historical process, and some situations that were considered legitimate in the past may be considered unethical in today's conditions. In addition, cultural and social differences may diversify ethical perspectives. The dynamic structure of ethical understanding brings the constant redefinition of boundaries. In this context, it is important to consider the local context and universal ethical principles when dealing with ethically sensitive issues related to the past. Indeed, determining the ethical boundaries between the past and the present may be possible by considering the historical background, changing norms, and cultural diversity (Seixas & Ercikan, 2015; Bevernage & Lorenz, 2013; Kahane, 2012).

It can be said that using historical ethics is important in social sciences in general and history and social studies education in particular. Democratic citizenship-oriented reform of history education can make important contributions to historical ethics. This approach improves students' ability to ethically evaluate past events and actions. Thus, the moral factors that play a role in historical decision-making processes can be seen more clearly. Furthermore, the historical experiences of different social groups and individuals can be analyzed from a pluralistic perspective. Injustices, discrimination, and human rights violations in the past are better understood. Students can develop healthier judgments today and in the future by analyzing the ethical dimensions of historical events. In this context, in history education, students' ability to critically evaluate evidence and to consider different perspectives is crucial in terms of historical ethics. Because by questioning the evidence and considering different perspectives, students can develop a critical attitude towards one-sided or manipulated history presentations. This is necessary for the uncovering of historical truth and justice. Furthermore, multiple perspectives allow for a more holistic and humane understanding of historical events and processes. This contributes to developing the historical, ethical principles of impartiality, objectivity, and empathy. Students' ability to question

evidence and consider different views can help them build a more democratic and peaceful society in the future (Barton & Levistik, 2004; VanSledright, 2011; Wineburg, 2001).

It can be said that the reflection of historical ethics in history and social studies education occurs through textbooks. Analyzing the content of textbooks in the context of historical ethics is important for students to learn both past realities and universal values holistically. This evaluation should be made by considering various dimensions. In this context, historical accuracy and honesty should be considered first. The textbooks' events, people, and developments must be presented objectively and realistically, and historical information must be conveyed completely and without distortion. In this context, the reliability of historical sources and references should be checked (Wineburg, 2001). Secondly, cultural sensitivity and diversity dimensions should also be considered when evaluating historical ethical content in textbooks. This is because different cultures, religions, and traditions should be presented in their historical context, cultural heritage and diversity should be respected, and there should be no prejudices and stereotypes (Banks, 2019). Thirdly, critical approach and topicality are also important. For this reason, it is necessary to evaluate historical events from today's perspective, develop historical consciousness and awareness, and update textbooks regularly in light of current developments (Wineburg, 2001). Impartiality and pluralism are other important aspects to consider when evaluating textbooks. Different perspectives, interpretations, and evaluations should be included in textbooks, and ideological, political, or cultural prejudices should be avoided. In this context, textbooks should be ensured to represent all segments of society (Loewen, 2018). In addition, textbooks and curricula should be updated to reflect cultural diversity and to enable students to recognize different cultures (Sears & Wright, 2004). Finally, human rights and ethical values should also be considered in evaluating historical content in textbooks. Universal values such as human rights, equality, justice, and freedom should be emphasized, and negative events such as discrimination, persecution, and oppression should be handled ethically. It is also important to reflect basic ethical principles (honesty, responsibility, empathy, etc.) (Noddings, 2013).

When the relevant literature is reviewed, it is seen that some studies have been conducted on the reflections of historical ethics, which has an important place in history and social studies education, on textbooks. Hickman and Porfilio (2012), through a critical analysis of history textbooks, revealed that the texts have ideological orientations and political agendas. Sleeter and Grant (2011) emphasize that textbooks and curricula are full of content that normalizes racist, sexist, and disability discrimination. Epstein (2009) examined how textbooks are interpreted in classrooms and communities in terms of race, identity, and pedagogy. This study shows how historical narratives give rise to different readings and understandings. Loewen (2008) questions the official historical narrative of American history textbooks and argues that these narratives distort many events and present students with false and misleading information. Wineburg (2001) emphasized the importance of developing students' historical thinking in history teaching and stated that history textbooks are often written from a biased and ideological perspective. On the other hand, Paxton (1999) stated in his study that history textbooks have biased, biased, and ideological content. The textbooks' historical narratives generally reflect dominant groups' perspectives and ignore different perspectives. This situation prevents students from evaluating the ethical dimensions of historical events and negatively affects the development of their critical thinking skills. Fitzgerald (1979) states that the narratives in history textbooks generally have unethical characteristics.

When the studies listed above are evaluated as a whole, it is noticeable that there are some deficiencies in historical ethics in history textbooks. When the literature in Türkiye is analyzed, it is noteworthy that no historical ethics studies exist. This situation brings up the need for a study that will show the place of historical ethics in the textbooks taught in Türkiye. It is believed that this study will fill the gap in the field, develop a perspective on the situation of history textbooks taught in Türkiye in terms of historical ethics, give an idea to textbook authors and inspire future research. This research aims to reveal the

situation of the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook in Türkiye regarding historical ethics. The research answered the following questions:

1. What is the status of the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook regarding the ethical dimension of historical accuracy and honesty?
2. What is the situation of the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook regarding cultural sensitivity and diversity ethical dimension?
3. What is the position of the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook in terms of human rights and ethical values ethical dimension?
4. What is the position of the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook regarding critical approach and topicality ethical dimension?
5. What is the situation of the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook regarding the impartiality and pluralism dimension?

METHOD

The document analysis method was used in this qualitative study. Document analysis is one of the qualitative research methods, and it is carried out by the researcher meticulously examining various written, visual, or electronic documents and systematically evaluating and interpreting them (Bowen, 2009). In this method, the researcher gets rid of his/her prejudices and analyses the documents from an objective point of view. In document analysis, the researcher goes beyond counting or coding and tries to identify important themes, patterns, and relationships in documents (Rapley, 2007). Content analysis includes coding the data, identifying themes, and examining relationships (Krippendorff, 2018). The main data source of the research is the Secondary History 9th-grade history textbook published by the Ministry of National Education (MoNE) of the Republic of Türkiye. The PDF (Portable Document Format) version included the printed book in the analysis. The evaluation criteria within the scope of historical ethics were established in line with the relevant literature (Ahonen, 2023; Epstein, 2009; Lévesque, 2008; Loewen, 2008; Noddings, 2013; Seixas, 2017; Seixas & Ercikan, 2015; Torpey, 2006). These criteria are historical accuracy and honesty, cultural sensitivity and diversity, human rights and ethical values, critical approach and topicality, impartiality and pluralism. Sub-categories and explanatory concepts were defined for each criterion.

The Method section needs to include the research design or the type of the study (cross-sectional, longitudinal, survey, experimental, ethnographic, etc.), the description of the sampling procedure (including the description of the population), or the selection of the study group, data collection instruments and procedures, data analysis, and the issues of validity, reliability and ethics.

Data Source
The primary data source of the research is the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook published by the Republic of Türkiye (T.C.) Ministry of National Education (MEB). This textbook was accepted as a textbook by the Ministry of National Education, Board of Education and Instruction on 24.06.2019, numbered 15, and published in 2021. Information about the book is shown in Table 1:

Table 1. Publication and content information of 9th-grade secondary school history textbook

Course Name	Ortaöğretim Tarih 9
Teaching Level	9
Year of Publication	2021
Printing Institution / Organisation	Republic of Türkiye Ministry of National Education
Number of Units	6
Number of Images	178
Number of Maps	38
Number of Page	224

When Table 1 is analyzed, it is seen that there are 178 visuals and 38 maps on 224 pages of 6 Units. Türkiye and the Turkish World map at the end of the book were included in the maps, but the visuals on the unit covers were not included. In addition, explanations of the unit cover visuals are given. Educational cover designs are of a quality to arouse the student's interest and curiosity, and the visuals support the student's learning process. Regarding ethics, the textbook's cover was used per the principles of impartiality and objectivity, and the book and unit cover designs avoided content that would negatively affect students' personality development and value judgments.

Data Collection Tool and Development

A textbook evaluation form was developed to evaluate the historical ethical dimension of the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook. In this direction, the "Textbook Evaluation Form in terms of Historical Ethics" was designed due to a systematic process. Firstly, a comprehensive literature review on historical ethics and textbook evaluation was conducted. As a result of this review, concepts, themes, and categories that are important in terms of historical ethics were identified. The aim was to create the content of the form in a way that covered these critical elements. Then, two academicians who are experts in history education and historical ethics were consulted. These two academicians, experts in their fields, made important suggestions about the content and structure of the form and suggested various evaluation criteria to increase its validity. They actively analyzed and interpreted the data collected during the pilot application process and contributed to the form's final form.

In line with the experts' suggestions, various arrangements were made to the form and content, and face validity was improved. The developed form was used to evaluate the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook, which was randomly selected from the history textbooks at different levels published by the Ministry of National Education, as it was quickly accessible for the researchers within the scope of a pilot application. Including textbooks at different levels in the study is important in expanding the scope of the form. The data collected during the pilot application provided feedback to the form development process. In the light of these data, final adjustments were made to the form, and the final version was created.

Table 2 Form for Analysing Textbooks in terms of Historical Ethics

Theme	Concepts	Description
Historical Accuracy And Integrity	Resource utilisation	To use a variety of reliable sources and different perspectives in historical narrative.
	Historical Evidence	Objective evaluation of historical events by supporting them with multifaceted evidence.
	Objective Narration	Pluralistic and objective historical narration.
	Transferring Historical Facts Correctly	To present historical facts accurately and comprehensively in their context.
Cultural Sensitivity and Diversity	Cultural Awareness	To evaluate the impact of different civilisations, cultures, religions and ethnic groups on each other.
	Intercultural Communication	To communicate by understanding and adapting to cultural differences.
	Cultural Sensitivity and Adaptation	Respect different cultures and act in harmony by endeavouring to understand them.
	Ethical Decision Making	Considering different perspectives, assessing potential impacts and striving for the best outcome.
	Democracy	Historical evaluation of democratic rights.
Human Rights and Ethical	Freedom	To analyse the historical transformations in the concept of freedom.
	Equality	To investigate the historical background of struggles for equality.

		Justice	To evaluate the historical meaning and applications of the concept of justice.
Critical Approach and Contemporaneity		Tolerance	To evaluate the historical dimension of the relationship between tolerance and pluralism.
		Humanism	To evaluate the reflections of human development in the historical process.
		Multidimensional handling	Enabling historical events to be analysed from different perspectives.
		Presenting different perspectives	Presenting various views on historical issues and encouraging students to think critically.
		Contextualisation (establishing a historical relationship)	Analyzing the historical background towards current events.
Impartiality and Pluralism		Objective narration	Impartial and objective historical narration.
		Polyphonic approach	Pluralistic history narration.
		Avoiding prejudices	Impartial and unbiased understanding of history.

Data Collection

A 9th-grade secondary school history textbook was selected as the main data source of the research. Since the textbook provides data in accordance with the purpose of the research and has high accessibility, it was preferred to be determined by convenience sampling method. Convenience sampling is a sampling method in which the researcher can collect data quickly and practically (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2013). The main reason for choosing the convenience sampling method is that the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook provides data suitable for the research and has high accessibility. This method, which provides convenience to the researchers regarding time and cost, allowed the study to be carried out quickly and effectively. The previously developed "Form for Analysing Textbooks in terms of Historical Ethics" was used in the data collection process. This form consists of 5 main themes and a total of 20 concepts. The data collection process was carried out systematically. Firstly, 6 units in the textbook were handled one by one, and each unit was analyzed in the context of 20 concepts in the form. The researchers carefully analyzed the textbook's texts, visuals, activities, and other elements and recorded their observations about each concept. The historical and ethical elements, approaches, and examples identified in the unit contents were marked in the form. The collected data were organized, classified, and analyzed. In this way, the strengths and weaknesses of the textbook in terms of historical ethics were identified.

Analysing the Data

The data collected in the study were analyzed using the content analysis method. Content analysis is a research technique for making reproducible and valid inferences from texts (or other meaningful topics) about their contexts of use. Content analysis has its unique approach to analyzing data, mainly from how the content, the object of analysis, is designed (Krippendorff, 2018). Social scientists can comprehend social reality multidimensionally by analyzing text types and making more holistic analyses. Therefore, these skills are among the indispensable qualifications of social scientists (Weber, 1990). A systematic and objective approach is important in evaluating historical and ethical elements in the textbook. Content analysis allows for a holistic evaluation by analyzing quantitative and qualitative data, and the content analysis method effectively reveals the contextual meanings of texts (Erlingsson & Brysiewicz, 2017). Contextual analyses of historical narratives in the textbooks allow deeper inferences to be made in terms of historical ethics. While analyzing the data within the scope of the research, themes, and codes related to these themes were created. Codes and themes were first created while analyzing the data

obtained within the scope of the research.   Codes and themes were derived from the content used in the research process. The textbook's content was analyzed during the textual analysis, and certain themes and codes corresponding to these themes were created. The results were combined around these themes, and the frequency of repetition (frequencies) and percentages were explained in tables. Credibility, transferability, consistency, and verifiability were utilized to ensure the reliability and validity of the research data. In this context, for the transferability of the research, the credibility of the research was ensured by including quotations from the History 9 textbook, which is the primary data source of the research, for the relevant themes. In this context, the transferability of the research was tried to be provided with direct quotations supporting the research data. Thus, it is aimed at helping readers better understand the context and findings of the research and allowing the research to be transferred to other environments. In addition, the researcher triangulation method was used to ensure the data's consistency within the research scope. Researcher triangulation is a method that aims to obtain multiple observations and results by involving two or more researchers in a study. While this approach helps to verify the findings, it also provides a broader perspective of the phenomenon being analyzed by presenting different perspectives. Thus, the research process is enriched, and a more comprehensive understanding emerges (Denzin, 2017). In this direction, three people in the research team tried to ensure the reliability of the research by independently analyzing and coding the texts in the textbook.

FINDINGS

A multidimensional analysis of the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook published by the Ministry of National Education of the Republic of Türkiye (MEB), which constitutes the main data source of the research, was carried out in terms of historical ethics. The findings obtained in this context are presented in detail below. In the first question of the study, the situation of the History 9 textbook in terms of the ethical dimension of historical accuracy and honesty was investigated. The findings obtained in this context are explained below.

Table 3 Analysis on Historical Accuracy and Honesty Dimension of 9th-grade secondary school history textbook

Main Theme	Sub-Dimensions	Unit 1 History and Time	Unit 2 Early Periods of Humanity	Unit 3 World in the Middle Ages	Unit 4 Turkish World in the Early and Middle Ages	Unit 5 The Birth of Islamic Civilisation	Unit 6 Acceptance of Islam by the Turks and the First Turkish Islamic States	**Total Frequency (f)**
	Resource utilisation	25	51	31	61	66	42	**276**
Historical Accuracy And Integrity	Historical Evidence	17	46	27	40	46	30	**206**
	Objective Narration	25	20	15	12	14	29	**115**
	Transferring Historical Facts Correctly	12	14	13	15	20	19	**93**
	Total Frequency (f)	**79**	**131**	**86**	**128**	**106**	**120**	

[4]When Table 3 is analyzed, it is seen that a total of 276 sources are used in 6 units in 9th-grade secondary school history textbook sources, visual sources, and whether sources were used in in-text passages were considered. Where does the Khan get his power from in Unit 4? (Kağan Gücünü Nereden Alıyor?[5]) In the Orhun text, examples from the Orkhon inscriptions were taken, and a bibliography was given at the end of the text. In addition, although 7 different historians were quoted on page 6[6], no bibliography was given (MEB, 2021, p.13, 108).

Türk Devletlerinde Meşruiyet Kaynağı

Kağan Gücünü Nereden Alıyor?

İlk Türk devleti olan Asya Hun Devleti'nde hükümdarlar, Gök Tanrı'nın tahta çıkardığı Tanhu unvanını kullanmıştır. Mete Han, MÖ 176'da Çin imparatoruna gönderdiği mektupta kendisini, Gök Tanrı tarafından tahta çıkartılmış Hunların büyük Şanyü'sü olarak ifade etmiştir. Orhun Yazıtlarında Bilge Kağan "Tanrı irade ettiği için kut'um olduğu için kağan oldum." demiştir. Uygur Devleti'nde de benzer durum söz konusudur. Uygurlara ait Karabalsagun Yazıtı'nda, Bögü Kağan'ın unvanı "Tengride kut bulmuş." olarak belirtilmiştir.

Kafesoğlu, 1995, s.237; Koca, 2002b, s.1071; Ögel, 2001a, s.67'den düzenlenmiştir.

Figure 2

Herodotos (Herodot) (MÖ 484-425) (Görsel 1.1)
Tarih, insanların ve insan topluluklarının başlarından geçenleri kaydetme yoluyla edinilen bilgidir.

İbn Haldun (1334-1406) (Görsel 1.2)
Tarih, gerçeği araştırmak ve olayların sebeplerini bulup ortaya koymaktır. Olayların ilkeleri incedir, nitelik ve sebepleri hakkındaki bilgi derindir.

Leopold von Ranke (Lepold fon Ranke) (1795-1886)
Tarih, hakikatte meydana gelmiş olaylarla ilgilidir. Gerçeğin ne olduğu belgelerde saklıdır ve gerçek ancak belgelerin eleştirisiyle ortaya çıkar. Belge yoksa tarih de yoktur.

Ahmet Cevdet Paşa (1822-1895)
Tarih bir olayın sadece filan tarihte olduğunu bilmek değil, geçmişte meydana gelen olayları değerlendirmek ve bu olaylardan ders almaktır.

Lucien Febvre (Lüsyan Fevr) (1878-1956)
Tarih, geçmiş ve bugünün incelenmesidir.

Edward H. Carr (Edvırd Kar) (1892-1982)
Tarih, tarihçi ile olgular arasında kesintisiz karşılıklı bir etkileşim süreci, bugün ile geçmiş arasında bitmez bir diyalogdur.

Halil İnalcık (1916-2016)
Gerçek bir tarih için kaynaklara gitmek, kaynakları iyi tenkit edip değerlendirmek gerekir.

Figure 3

As for the use of historical evidence, a total of 206 pieces of evidence were utilised. Historical visual objects, illustrations, pictures and maps were taken into consideration as evidence. For example. The Land Forces coat of arms in Unit 4 was not taken into consideration as historical evidence because it cannot be considered as a direct historical evidence (MEB, 2021, p.102). It is seen that a total of 92 examples of objective expression were identified in 6 units. While determining the examples of objective expression, criteria such as impartiality, accuracy, descriptivity, academic style, context compatibility and usage in scientific disciplines were taken as basis. For example, while Unit 6 Visual 6.20 I. Crusade (Engraving)[7] was evaluated within the scope of

Ülkenin batısındaki bu taht mücadelelerini kazanan Berkyaruk, bu kez de devletin doğusunda isyan eden diğer amcası Arslan Argun'u bertaraf etti ve böylece hâkimiyetini pekiştirdi.

Sultan Berkyaruk Dönemi'nin önemli olaylarından birisi de Haçlı Seferleri'nin başlamasıdır. Türkleri Anadolu'dan atmak ve Kudüs'ü ele geçirmek amacıyla Avrupa'dan harekete geçen Haçlı ordusu (Görsel 6.20) Antakya'ya kadar ilerleyerek burayı kuşattı. Şehrin valisi, Berkyaruk'tan yardım istedi. Berkyaruk, Musul emirini bu işle görevlendirdi. Ancak Musul emiri, Haçlılarla yapılan savaşı kaybetti. Böylece Antakya'yı

Görsel 6.20
I. Haçlı Seferi
(Gravür)

Figure 4

---

[5] The text in Figure 2: From Where Does the Khan Derive His Power? In the Asian Hun State, the first Turkish state, the rulers used the title of Tanhu, which the Sky God enthroned. In the letter he sent to the Chinese emperor in 176 BC, Mete Khan expressed himself as the great Shanyü of the Huns enthroned by Sky God. In the Orkhon Inscriptions, Bilge Kagan said, "I became a kagan because God willed it, because I had kut."There is a similar situation in the Uighur State. In the Karabalsagun Inscription of the Uighurs, the title of Bögü Kagan is stated as "Tengride kut bulmuş." Kafesoğlu, 1995, p.237; Koca, 2002b, p.1071; Ögel, 2001a, Edited from p.67.

[6] The text in Figure 3; Herodotus (Herodotus) (484-425 BC) (Image 1.1) History is the knowledge gained by recording what happened to people and human societies. is knowledge. Ibn Khaldun (1334-1406) (Image 1.2) History is to investigate the truth and discover the causes of events. Principles of events are subtle, and knowledge of their nature and causes is deep. Leopold von Ranke (Lepold fon Ranke) (1795-1886) History is concerned with events that took place. The truth is hidden in documents, and the truth can only be revealed by criticising documents. If there are no documents, there is no history. Ahmet Cevdet Pasha (1822-1895) History is not only to know that an event happened on such and such a date but also to evaluate the events that occurred in the past and to take lessons from these events. Lucien Febvre (Lusian Fevr) (1878-1956) History studies the past and the present. Edward H. Carr (Edvard Kar) (1892-1982)History is an uninterrupted interaction process between the historian and the facts, between the present and the past. is an endless dialogue between them. Halil İnalcık (1916-2016) For an accurate history, it is necessary to go to the sources to criticise and evaluate the sources well.

[7] The text in Figure 4 Berkyaruk, who won these throne struggles in the west of the country, eliminated his other uncle Arslan Argun, who rebelled east of the state and thus consolidated his sovereignty. One of the important events of Sultan Berkyaruk's reign was the beginning of the Crusades.

"Accuracy, Descriptivism, Academic style", Unit 6 Visual 6.24 Nizâmülmülk (Representative) was evaluated within the scope of descriptivism (MEB, 2021, p.200, 208).

Finally, the criteria such as historical accuracy, evidence-based expression, objective approach, integrity and consistency, language and expression were taken as basis while determining the examples of transferring historical facts correctly. In the text titled Climate and Migrations in Unit 2, the text presents a holistic narrative that covers all important points on the subject, and the transitions and connections between paragraphs are clear and fluent. In addition, the relationships between ideas, events and concepts are presented coherently.

In the second question of the study, the situation of the History 9 textbook in terms of cultural sensitivity and diversity ethical dimension was investigated. The findings obtained in this context are explained below.

Table 4 Analysis of 9th-grade secondary school history textbook on Cultural Sensitivity and Diversity Dimension

Main Theme	Sub-Dimensions	Unit Names and Frequencies						Total Frequency *(f)*
		Unit 1 History and Time	Unit 2 Early Periods of Humanity	Unit 3 World in the Middle Ages	Unit 4 Turkish World in the Early and Middle Ages	Unit 5 The Birth of Islamic Civilisation	Unit 6 Acceptance of Islam by the Turks and the First Turkish Islamic States	
Cultural Sensitivity and Diversityilik	Cultural Awareness	1	1	2	3	2	3	**12**
	Intercultural Communication	1	1	2	2	1	3	**10**
	Cultural Sensitivity and Adaptation	1	1	2	2	1	3	**10**
	Ethical Decision Making	1	1	3	2	1	1	**9**
Total Frequency *(f)*		**4**	**4**	**9**	**9**	**9**	**10**	

When Table 4 is analyzed, it is seen that 12 examples of cultural awareness are used in 6 units in the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook. While determining the examples of cultural awareness, qualities such as being aware of the characteristics, norms, and values of one's own culture, accepting that other cultures also have their unique qualities, and the ability to understand them were taken as criteria. In Unit 4 4.2. Life Style Formed by Geography (Coğrafya İle Oluşan Yaşam Tarzı), awareness of the reason for the formation of culture was created by expressing that the lifestyle of Turks was shaped by the influence of the steppe geography (MEB, 2021, pp.99-101). It is seen that intercultural communication is used in a total of 10 different places. While determining this, the existence of interaction (information, ideas, values) exchange patterns between different cultures and the presence of elements for cultural convergence and integration were considered.

The Crusader army, which mobilized from Europe to expel the Turks from Anatolia and capture Jerusalem (Figure 6.20), advanced to Antioch and besieged it. The governor of the city asked for help from Berkyaruk. Berkyaruk assigned the emir of Mosul to this task. However, the emir of Mosul lost the war with the Crusaders. Thus, the Crusaders captured Antioch and advanced until Jerusalem.

JIRTE

In Unit 3, under the title "Trade in the Middle Ages" (Ortaçağda Ticaret), it is stated that trade routes enable cultural exchange between continents as well as commercial products (MEB, 2021, p.79). It is seen that a total of 9 examples of cultural sensitivity and adaptation were identified in 6 units, and no examples were identified in Unit 2. While determining examples of cultural sensitivity and adaptation, criteria such as understanding, respect, empathy, awareness, and suitability to the cultural context were considered. The examples given in the text titled Hun-China Policies (Hun-Çin Politikaları)[8] in Unit 3 are evaluated within this

Figure 5

scope as they show that Turks and Uyghurs are sensitive to their cultural values and adapt to external cultural influences (MEB, 2021, p.112).

Eight examples were identified in the context of ethical decision-making. Situations such as benefit-harm, justice-equality, autonomy, honesty, responsibility, environment, and long-term effects were considered ethical decision-making criteria. In Unit 3 3.4, "Laws are Developing," examples of laws from different periods of history were given to contribute to the student's ethical decision-making process (MEB, 2021, pp. 88-90).

In the third question of the study, the situation of the History 9 textbook in terms of Human Rights and Ethical Values ethical dimension was investigated. The findings obtained in this context are explained below.

Table 5 Analysis of Human Rights and Ethical Values Dimension of 9th-grade secondary school history textbook

Main Theme	Sub-Dimensions	Unit 1 History and Time	Unit 2 Early Periods of Humanity	Unit 3 World in the Middle Ages	Unit 4 Turkish World in the Early and Middle Ages	Unit 5 The Birth of Islamic Civilisation	Unit 6 Acceptance of Islam by the Turks and the First Turkish Islamic States	Total Frequency (f)
					Unit Names and Frequencies			
Human Rights and Ethical Values Dimension	Democracy	-	4	4	5	4	2	**19**
	Freedom	-	3	8	3	2	2	**18**
	Equality	-	3	4	5	3	2	**17**
	Justice	-	3	4	5	4	6	**22**
	Tolerance	-	-	3	4	4	2	**13**
	Humanism	-	-	3	8	4	8	**23**

---

[8] The text in Figure 5, Hun-Chinese Politics, Mete Khan had followed a national policy against China. Accordingly, the Hun State would put China under pressure with its war power (Image 4.23), and the needs of the state and the people would be provided from China through taxation or trade. Mete Khan aimed to crush the Chinese Emperor and his army morally with the policy he implemented and to make them accept his superiority over China. The Chinese Empire also had a policy against the Huns. The essence of this policy was to dominate the Huns. Chinese emperors introduced many agents into the Hun country in the entourage of Chinese princesses, whom they sent as wives to Hun kings, especially in times of peace. These agents had created enmity among Hun beys and communities through various intrigues. In addition, by sending luxury goods to the Hun country through trade, he had accustomed the Huns to comfort and pleasure. This situation loosened the warrior skills of the Turks. Edited from Koca, 2002a, p.690,695.

158

Total Frequency *(f)*	13	26	30	21	22

When Table 5 is analysed, it is seen that a total of 19 examples of democracy-related expressions are used in 6 units in the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook. While determining the examples of democracy, protection and guarantee of fundamental rights and freedoms (expression, belief, organisation, etc.). Criteria such as equality, participation (economic and administrative), pluralism, rule of law, minority rights, power sharing are taken as basis. In Unit 1, there are no examples or explanations about the criterion of democracy and the other five criteria. This chapter gives information about the definition of history, the methodology of history, the relationship between history and other disciplines and Turkish historiography. In the passage titled Greek Civilisation (Yunan Medeniyeti)[9] in Unit 2, there

is a passage in which it is stated that the elections held in Greek cities are considered the first traces of republic and democracy. With this example, it can be stated that the political and administrative transformations in Greek cities were intended to reflect that elements such as democracy, power sharing and political freedoms began to gain importance in the ethical values of the period (MoNE, 2021, p.45).

In addition, it is seen that a total of 18 expressions related to the concept of freedom were identified in 6 units. While

Yunan Medeniyeti

Yunan kentlerinde yapılan seçimler, cumhuriyet ve demokrasinin ilk izleri kabul edilir. Başta Aristoteles (Aristo) olmak üzere Yunan bilginleri, bitkilere ve hayvanlara ilişkin bilimsel bilgileri derleyerek botanik ve zooloji alanlarının temellerini atmıştır. Miletli Thales (Tales) ve Pythagoras (Pisagor); matematik, astronomi ve felsefe alanında önemli çalışmalar yapmıştır.

Figure 6

determining the examples for the concept of freedom, qualities such as the protection of fundamental rights and freedoms of individuals, freedom of expression, belief and action, and personal autonomy and independence were taken as criteria. In Unit 5, "With the Medina Convention, citizens were given a social and political identity, and an unprecedented citizenship right was offered in that era. Non-Muslims, who were given freedom of belief and opinion, were provided with the security of property and life, and cheating and disloyalty were also prohibited." statement was taken as an example of religious and intellectual freedom. While determining examples of equality; qualities such as non-discrimination in social, legal, cultural and economic areas, everyone having equal rights, opportunities and opportunities, different cultures and traditions being seen as equal value, ensuring justice in taxation and social assistance were taken as criteria and a total of 17 expressions were identified in this context in 6 units. In the reading passage given as a precursor to the open-ended questions on page 211 of Unit 6, the importance of equality criterion in the context of historical ethics is emphasised by pointing out the importance given to gender equality in the teachings of Hodja Ahmet Yesevi (MEB, 2021, p.211). While determining the examples of justice, qualities such as equal treatment, equality in social life and before the law were taken as criteria and it is clearly seen in Table 5 that 22 sample expressions were identified in this context. In Unit 3, while listing examples of family and criminal law in the Genghis Law, "The spiritual heads of all religions should be exempt from all kinds of taxes and obligations." (MEB, 2021, p.90). While determining examples of tolerance; qualities such as respect for differences, pluralism and acceptance of diversity, dialogue, understanding, compromise were taken as criteria, and it is clearly seen in the table above that a total of 13 expressions were identified in this context in 6 units. Again, in Unit 3, one of the examples in the Genghis Law is an example in terms of shedding light on the ethical value system of the medieval period in terms of tolerance by including the statement "The man who passes by the men who are eating should immediately get off the horse, sit down to eat without the permission of those who are eating, and those who are eating should not prevent this" (MEB, 2021, p.90).

---

[9] The text in Figure 6, Greek Civilisation, shows that elections held in Greek cities are considered the first traces of republicanism and democracy. Greek scholars, especially Aristotle (Aristotle), laid the foundations of botany and zoology by compiling scientific information on plants and animals. Thales (Tales) and Pythagoras (Pythagoras) of Miletus, mathematics, and astronomy, made important studies in philosophy.

While determining the examples of humanism, qualities such as respect for human dignity and rights, prioritizing human values, and considering the welfare and self-confidence of the individual were determined as criteria. As can be seen in Table 5, a total of 23 expressions were identified in this context, and no expression was identified in Unit 1 and Unit 2. For example, in Unit 3, Article 25 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights states that "Mother and child have the right to care and assistance. All children, whether born in or out of wedlock, benefit from the same social protection"[10], emphasizing humanism (MEB, 2021, p.89).

İnsan Hakları Evrensel Beyannamesi

• Madde 25- Ana ve çocuk özen ve yardım görme hakkına sahiptir. Bütün çocuklar evlilik içinde veya dışında doğsunlar aynı sosyal korunmadan faydalanırlar.

Figure 7

In the fourth question of the study, the situation of the History 9 textbook in terms of critical approach and topicality ethical dimension was investigated. The findings obtained in this context are explained below.

Table 6 Analysis of 9th-grade secondary school history textbook on Critical Approach and Contemporaneity Dimension

Main Theme	Sub-Dimensions	Unit 1 History and Time	Unit 2 Early Periods of Humanity	Unit 3 World in the Middle Ages	Unit 4 Turkish World in the Early and Middle Ages	Unit 5 The Birth of Islamic Civilisation	Unit 6 Acceptance of Islam by the Turks and the First Turkish Islamic States	Total Frequency (f)
		Unit Names and Frequencies						
Critical Approach and Contemporaneity	Multidimensional handling	4	13	6	3	6	4	**36**
	Presenting different perspectives	7	8	9	14	13	3	**54**
	Contextualisation (establishing a historical relationship)	11	14	10	6	12	9	**62**
Total Frequency (f)		**22**	**35**	**25**	**23**	**31**	**16**	

When Table 6 is analyzed, 36 multifaceted handling examples are used in 6 units in the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook. While determining the multifaceted handling examples, situations such as establishing a relationship between historical events and periods, evaluating the subject from a historical perspective, dealing with different dimensions of the subject such as economic, political, and socio-cultural comprehensively, evaluating the events from an interrogative, objective perspective and examining the subject by taking into account the current conditions and developments of the subject were taken as criteria. In the information passage titled Türkiye as a Geographical Name in Unit 4, the use of the word Türkiye for different geographical regions from the 6th century to the present day is given, and a more comprehensive and versatile perspective on the subject is presented to the reader. These different usages are up-to-date in terms of reflecting the changing and developing structure of Turkish history and geography. For this reason, the different geographical uses of the word "Türkiye" in Byzantine sources were evaluated within the scope of the criterion of "Critical Approach and Multi-dimensional handling in the dimension of topicality" (MEB, 2021, p.98).

---

[10] The text in Figure 7; Article 25. Mother and child shall have the right to care and assistance. All children shall enjoy the same social protection, whether born within or outside marriage.

In addition, 54 examples of presenting different perspectives were identified in 6 units. In the determination of these examples, in the determination of the examples of presenting different perspectives, multi-dimensional evaluation of the subject, comprehensive analysis within the historical context, and consideration of current trends were adopted as criteria. In Unit 4, it is stated that the name Turk has different meanings in various sources and research. According to Chinese sources, it is stated that it means "helmet," according to Kashgarlı Mahmut, "age of maturity," according to A. Wambery "derivation", according to Ziya Gökalp "law and order owner"[11]. The presentation of these different approaches is considered within the scope of providing the reader with different perspectives on how the Turkish name has been interpreted in the historical process (MEB, 2021, p.98).

İlk olarak Avrasya'da görülen Türkleri araştıran bilim insanları, bu kadim milletin adını en eski tarihî kaynaklarda aramıştır. Türk adına gerek kaynaklarda gerekse araştırmalarda çeşitli anlamlar verilmiştir. Türk adı; Çin kaynaklarına göre "miğ-fer", Kaşgarlı Mahmut'a göre "olgunluk çağı", A. Wambery'e (Vambrey) göre "türemek", Ziya Gökalp'e göre "kanun ve nizam sahibi" anlamına gelmektedir.

Figure 8

Finally, in Table 6, it is seen that a total of 62 examples were identified in 6 units in the sub-dimension of Contextualisation (Establishing a historical relationship). In determining these examples, qualities such as establishing a relationship between the past and the present, considering the period's conditions and value judgments, and identifying examples containing anachronism (time incompatibility) were determined as criteria. In Unit 1, "In a 1995 film about eighteenth-century Scotland, the actor wears a kilt. However, this garment was invented and used in the XVI century." Giving an example ensures that attention is drawn to anachronism.

In the fifth question of the study, the situation of the History 9 textbook in terms of impartiality and pluralism ethical dimension was investigated. The findings obtained in this context are explained below.

Table 7 Analysis of 9th-grade secondary school history textbook on Impartiality and Pluralism Dimension

Main Theme	Sub-Dimensions	Unit Names and Frequencies						Total Frequency *(f)*
		Unit 1 History and Time	Unit 2 Early Periods of Humanity	Unit 3 World in the Middle Ages	Unit 4 Turkish World in the Early and Middle Ages	Unit 5 The Birth of Islamic Civilisation	Unit 6 Acceptance of Islam by the Turks and the First Turkish Islamic States	
Impartiality and Pluralism	Objective narration	3	20	5	10	6	11	**52**
	Polyphonic approach	3	6	2	5	5	6	**24**
	Avoiding prejudices	4	10	7	7	5	5	**38**
Total Frequency *(f)*		**10**	**36**	**14**	**22**	**16**	**21**	

---

[11] The text in Figure 8; Scientists researching the Turks, who first appeared in Eurasia, searched for the name of this ancient nation in the oldest historical sources. The name Turk has been given various meanings in both sources and research. The name Turk means "helmet" according to Chinese sources, "age of maturity" according to Kashgarli Mahmut, and "derivation" according to A. Wambery (Vambrey), "owner of law and order" according to Ziya Gokalp.

When Table 7 is analysed, it is seen that a total of 52 examples of objective narration are used in 6 units in the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook. While determining the examples of objective narration, qualities such as using an impartial and objective language were determined as the basic criterion. In Unit 3, "The Silk Road represents a trade route starting from China and ending in Europe via Anatolia and the Mediterranean." This is an example determined in this context (MEB, 2021, p.93). Within the scope of polyphonic approach, a total of 24 examples were identified in 6 units. The criterion taken as a basis in determining the examples of polyphonic expression is the presentation of different sources, perspectives, interpretations or explanations about the historical subject or event. In this direction, in the passage titled "The rise and end of the Mongols"[12] (Moğolların Yükselişi ve Sonu) in Unit 3, a polyphonic narrative was presented by reflecting the perspectives of the Mongols, the Chinese and Kublai Khan (MEB, 2021, p.98). It is understood from Table 7 that there are a total of 38 statements in the book within the scope of avoiding prejudices. In determining the examples of avoiding prejudices, it was taken as a basis to convey the information about

Moğolların Yükselişi ve Sonu

Cengiz Han, boylar arası çatışmaları önlemiş ve halkının enerjisini daha kazançlı olan istilalara yöneltmiştir. Moğol toplulukların göçebe yaşam tarzından edindikleri yetenekleri çok iyi kullanmıştır. Ata binmekte usta olan askerler savaşta üstünlük sağlamış ve rakiplerine anı ve yıkıcı baskınlar düzenleyebilmiştir. Cengiz Han'ın ölümünden sonra onun torunu Kubilay Han, Çin'i yönetmeye başlamış ama Moğolların göçebe gelenekleriyle Çinlilerin yerleşik kültürü arasında denge sağlayamamıştır. Eskiden yağmalarla doğrudan ganimet elde eden Moğollar, artık iyi yönetim ve vergi tahsilatının faydalarını gecikmeli olarak görebilmiştir. Kubilay Han, bir tarafta Moğolları hoşnut etmek için onlara Çinlilerden daha çok hak tanırken bir taraftan da geleneksel Çin elitlerinin desteğini sağlamak için Konfüçyüsçü âlimleri desteklemiş ve onlara tapınaklar kurmuştur. Savaşçı kimliklerini korumakta güçlük çeken Moğol yönetimi yıllarca süren kıtlık, salgınlar ve saraydaki yozlaşmanın ardından çıkan isyanlar sonunda yıkılmıştır. Çin yüzyılı aşkın süren Moğol işgalinin ardından yeniden yerli Çinlilerin eline geçmiştir.

Heyworth-Dunne, 2021 s.102-103'ten düzenlenmiştir.

Figure 9

the past periods in an objective and impartial way by getting rid of the present point of view. In addition to this, the criterion was the balanced reflection of all positive and negative aspects of civilisations and societies in the book. In Unit 2, "Göbeklitepe's structural and formal features prove that the people living in that period had a strong idea of God and used an advanced level of religious symbolism, contrary to popular belief" While making this determination in the book, the conditions of the past were taken into consideration, moving away from today's modern perspective, as well as an objective evaluation in the light of archaeological data, without a biased approach by the author (MEB, 2021, p.64).

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

In this study, an in-depth evaluation of the historical ethics dimension of the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook used in Türkiye was conducted. The results show that the book generally observes the principles of historical ethics, but there is a need for more comprehensive content in some areas. In terms of historical accuracy and honesty, quite positive examples were found in the book. In particular, the use of reliable sources, the presentation of historical evidence, the adoption of an objective narrative style, and the accurate presentation of historical facts with their contexts are noteworthy. These issues enable students to acquire historical knowledge reliably and comprehensively. In addition, the presentation of historical facts without distortion contributes to students' critical evaluation of historical events. In the textbook, the fact that the causes and consequences of events are handled holistically supports the correct understanding of historical facts. In this context, the positive examples in terms of historical accuracy and honesty in the textbook differ from the criticisms of researchers such as Wineburg (2001) and Loewen (2008) for the distortion of historical facts in textbooks. In addition, while (Epstein, 2009; Paxton, 1999) criticized the ideological and biased perspective of textbooks, the results obtained

---

[12] In the text in Figure 7, Rise and Fall of the Mongols, Genghis Khan prevented conflicts between tribes and directed the energies of his people towards more profitable invasions. He used the skills that Mongolian communities had acquired from their nomadic lifestyle. Soldiers who were skillful at riding horses gained the upper hand in battle and were able to organize sudden and devastating raids on their opponents. After the death of Genghis Khan, his grandson Kublai Khan began to rule China, but he could not find a balance between the nomadic traditions of the Mongols and the settled culture of the Chinese. The Mongols, who in the past had obtained booty directly through plunder, could now belatedly realize the benefits of good governance and tax collection. On the one hand, Kublai Khan granted the Mongols more rights than the Chinese in order to please the Mongols. On the other hand, he supported Confucian scholars and established temples to secure the support of the traditional Chinese elite. The Mongol government, which had difficulty in maintaining its warrior identity, collapsed after years of famine, epidemics, and rebellions following corruption in the palace. After more than a century of Mongol occupation, China was again in the hands of the indigenous Chinese. Edited from Heyworth-Dunne, 2021, pp.102-103.

from the findings of this article are evaluated positively in terms of objective narration and presentation of historical evidence.

The book also contains positive examples in the dimension of cultural sensitivity and diversity. The inclusion of information about different civilisations, religions, societies, ethnic groups and genders contributes to students' awareness of cultural diversity. However, it can be said that there is a need for more rich and varied content in this area. For example, topics such as the interaction of different cultures, intercultural dialogue, cultural sensitivity and ethical decision-making can be included in more detail. Thus, students can develop a more sensitive and empathetic perspective towards cultural differences. This finding is in line with the views of Banks (2019) and Sears and Wright (2004) on the necessity of multicultural education.

There are positive examples in the textbook in the context of human rights and ethical values. Emphasising universal values such as democracy, freedom, equality, justice, tolerance and humanism contributes to students' better understanding of ethical issues and human rights in the historical process. In addition, examining the ethical dimension in historical events helps students to develop their moral reasoning skills. In addition, it can be suggested that human rights violations, ethical dilemmas and solutions to these issues should be given more space. While this finding is similar to Noddings' (2013) study which emphasises the importance of ethical values in education, it differs from Sleeter and Grant's (2011) study which criticises discriminatory content in textbooks.

When evaluated in terms of critical approach and topicality, it is seen that the textbook deals with historical events from multiple perspectives, presents different perspectives and contextualises them. This approach helps students develop historical thinking skills. Examining historical events from multiple perspectives and establishing contextual relationships contribute to students' understanding of events more comprehensively and in depth. In addition, associating historical events with current contexts enables students to gain historical consciousness and awareness. These findings suggest that the History 9 textbook deals with historical events in a multidimensional way, presents different perspectives and makes contextualisation. These findings coincide with VanSledright's (2011) and Barton and Levstik's (2004) views on the importance of historical thinking. In this context, the History course book has been prepared at a level that can provide students with historical thinking skills and contribute to their more critical and multidimensional evaluation of history.

Positive examples were also found in the book in terms of impartiality and pluralism. Objective narration, polyphonic approach and avoiding prejudices allow students to evaluate historical events in multiple ways and to take into account different interpretations. Reducing ideological and political orientations in historical narratives can help students gain a more independent and critical perspective. These findings differ from Fittzgerald's (1979) and Loewen's (2008) criticisms of ideological orientations in textbooks.

In general, it can be said that the 9th-grade secondary school history textbook offers important achievements in the context of historical ethics. However, it is recommended to include richer and more diverse content in terms of cultural sensitivity and diversity, as well as human rights and ethical values. In particular, more comprehensive coverage of intercultural interaction, ethical decision-making, human rights violations in historical events, and ethical debates may be important for students to gain historical awareness and sensitivity. Similarly, examining and improving historical ethics textbooks at other grade levels is very important for students to comprehend historical events from a holistic and ethical perspective. Observing historical and ethical principles in history education can contribute to students' development of historical thinking, empathy, moral reasoning, and critical perspective. In this context, it is important to restructure history textbooks as well as history education practices by considering historical ethics. Thus, students can evaluate historical events more holistically, impartially, and ethically.

This situation can contribute to the students growing up as responsible citizens who are more sensitive to historical and current social issues.

Developing History Education Policies Based on Historical Ethics
In order to strengthen historical ethics in history education, various steps should be taken at the policy level. The Ministry of National Education and related institutions and organisations should prioritise historical ethics in history education. Thus, it will be possible to strengthen the historical ethics perspective in many areas, from teacher training to textbooks, from curricula to teaching programs. In addition, sufficient budget should be allocated to support teachers and educational stakeholders on historical ethics. Financial resources should be provided for in-service training, guidance materials, conferences, and workshops. Finally, the issue of historical ethics should be explicitly included in documents such as educational policies, strategic plans, and action plans, and concrete goals and implementation steps should be defined in this field. Thus, historical ethical principles can be systematically integrated into the education system.

Statement of Researchers
Researchers' contribution rate statement: The authors contributed equally to the article.
Conflict statement: The Authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.
Support and thanks: None.

REFERENCES

Ahonen, S. (2023). History as an ethical craft — a study of ethical reasons in the explanation of historical acts. *Qeios,* 1-19. https://doi.org/10.32388/2YJIHE

Arnold, J. H. (2000). *History: a very short introduction.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Ashby, R. (1995). History teaching approaches. In M. Carnall (Ed.), *Teaching history* (pp. 94-103). London, UK: Routledge.

Banks, J. A. (2019). *An introduction to multicultural education* (6th ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson.

Banks, J. A. (2015). *Cultural diversity and education: Foundations, curriculum, and teaching.* Routledge.

Barton, K. C., & Levstik, L. S. (2004). *Teaching history for the common good.* Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Bevernage, B., & Lorenz, C. (Eds.). (2013). *Breaking up time: negotiating the borders between present, past and future.* Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.

Bloch, M. (1964). *The historian's craft,* New York: A Division of penguin random house llc.

Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document analysis as a qualitative research method. *Qualitative Research Journal, 9(2),* 27-40. https://doi.org/10.3316/QRJ0902027

Chang'ach, J. (2013). *Development of historical thought upto 1900,* Lap Lambert Academic Publishing.

Chapman, A., Perikleous, L., Yakinthou, C., Celal, R. Z. (2011). *Thinking historically about missing persons: a guide for teachers.* Introduction & acknowledgements. Association for historical dialogue and research.

Collingwood, R. G. (2005). *Tarihin ilkeleri [The principles of history].* Çev. A.H. Aydoğan, İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları.

Collingwood, R. G. (1994). *The idea of history,* New York: Oxford University Press

Collingwood, R. G. (1939). *An autobiography.* Oxford: Oxford University.

Denos, M., Case, R., Seixas, P. C., Clark, P. (2023). Tarihsel düşünmeyi öğretmek *[Teaching about historical thinking].* (Çev ed. E. Demircioğlu ve İ. H. Demircioğlu), Ankara: Pegem Akademi.

Denzin, N. K. (2017). *The research act: a theoretical introduction to sociological methods.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Dilek, D. (2007). *Tarih derslerinde öğrenme ve düşünce gelişimi. [The Development of Learning and Thinking in the History Classes].* Ankara: Nobel Yayınevi.

Durant, W., & Durant, A. (1968). *The lessons of history*. NY: Simon & Schuster.

Erlingsson, C., & Brysiewicz, P. (2017). A hands-on guide to doing content analysis. *African Journal of Emergency Medicine, 7(3),* 93-99. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.afjem.2017.08.001

Epstein, T. (2009). *Interpreting national history: race, identity, and pedagogy in classrooms and communities.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Fitzgerald, F. (1979). The myth of objectivity in textbook publishing. *The Phi Delta Kappan, 60(10),* 723-726.

Genç, İ. (2023). Peter Seixas. In B. Ata, A. Altun & S. Kaymakcı (eds). *Yurt dışında tarih eğitimi kişiler ve eserleri [History education abroad: people and works].* (pp .235-253). İstanbul: İber Akademi.

Halbwachs, M. (1992). *On collective memory (Heritage of sociology series).* University of Chicago Press.

Hickman, H., & Porfilio, B. J. (Eds.). (2012). *The new politics of the textbook: Problematizing the portrayal of marginalized groups in textbooks*. Sense Publishers.

İbn Haldun (1977). *Mukaddime [An introduction to history].* (Çev. T. Dursun), Basım yeri belirsiz: Onur Yayınları.

Jenkins, K. (2003). *Refiguring history: new thoughts on an old discipline.* Routledge

Kabapınar, Y. (2009). *Öğretmen adaylarinin kronoloji becerilerinin saptanmasina yönelik bir çalişma. IV. Sosyal bilimler eğitimi kongresi, (7-9 Ekim), [A study to determine the chronology skills of teacher candidates. IV. Social science education congress (October 7-9)].* İstanbul, Marmara University.

Kahane, R. (2012). The Problems of historical ethics: a philosophical investigation. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Harvard University, Cambridge, MA.

Karabağ, Ş. G. (2010). Tarihsel empati becerisi: öğretimi, ölçülmesi ve değerlendirilmesi [The historical empathy skill: teaching, measurement and assessment] (Ed. M. Safran). *Tarih Nasıl Öğretilir? Tarih öğretmenleri için Özel Öğretim Yöntemleri [How to Teach History? Special teaching methods for history teachers].* İstanbul. Yeni İnsan Yayınevi, pp. 116-123.

Krippendorff, K. (2018). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology.* Sage publications.

Lee, P. (2005). Historical literacy: Theory and research. *International Journal of Historical Learning, Teaching and Research, 5(1),* 29-40. https://doi.org/10.18546/herj.05.1.05

Lévesque, S., & Clark, P. (2018). Historical thinking: Definitions and educational applications. In S. A. Metzger & L. McArthur Harris (Eds.), *The Wiley international handbook of history teaching and learning* (pp. 119-148). Wiley-Blackwell.

Lévesque, S. (2008). *Thinking historically: Educating students for the twenty-first century.* Toronto, Canada: University of Toronto Press.

Levstik, L.S., & Barton, K.C. (2011). *Doing history: Investigating with children in elementary and middle schools.* Routledge.

Liddell, H.G. & Scott, R. (1996). *A Greek-English lexicon,* Clarendon Press, Oxford.

Loewen, J. W. (2008). *Lies my teacher told me: everything your American history textbook got wrong*. New York, NY: The New Press.

Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı. (2023). *Ortaöğretim tarih 9 ders kitabı [9th grade secondary school history textbook]*. Ankara: Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı. Retrieved from https://ogmmateryal.eba.gov.tr/panel/upload/pdf/vxpqmdt 0axe.pdf

Noddings, N. (2013). *Education and democracy in the 21st century*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.

Özlem, D. (2010). *Tarih felsefesi [The Philosophy of History]*. İstanbul: Say Yayınları.

Paxton, R. J. (1999). A deafening silence: History textbooks and the students who read them. Review of *Educational Research, 69(3),* 315-339. https://doi.org/10.2307/1170542

Rapley, T. (2007). *Doing conversation, discourse and document analysis*. Sage.

Ricoeur, P. (2004). *Memory, history, forgetting*. University of Chicago Press.

Rüsen, J. (2004). Historical consciousness: Narrative structure, moral function, and ontogenetic development. In P. Seixas (Ed.), *Theorizing historical consciousness* (pp. 63-85). Toronto, Canada: University of Toronto Press.

Rüsen, J. (1993). *Studies in metahistory*. Human Sciences Research Council.

Safran, M., & Şimşek, A. (2006). Development of historical time concept in elementary school's students. *Elementary Education Online, 5(2),* 87-109. Retrieved from https://ilkogretim-online.org/index.php/pub/article/view/523

Safran, M. (2010). Tarih nerededir? [Where is history?]. In M. Safran. (Ed), Tarih Nasıl Öğretilir? Tarih öğretmenleri için Özel Öğretim Yöntemleri *[How to teach history? special teaching methods for history teachers].* (pp. 19-22). İstanbul. Yeni İnsan Yayınevi.

Sandwell, R., & Von Heyking, A. (Eds.). (2014). *Becoming a history teacher: Sustaining practices in historical thinking and knowing*. University of Toronto Press.

Schreier, M. (2012). *Qualitative content analysis in practice.* Sage.

Sears, A. M., & Wright, I. (2004). *Challenges and prospects for Canadian social studies*. Pacific Educational Press.

Seixas, P. (2017) A model of historical thinking, *Educational Philosophy and Theory, 49(6),* 593-605, https://doi.org/10.1080/00131857.2015.1101363.

Seixas, P., & Ercikan, K. (Eds.). (2015). *New directions in assessing historical thinking.* Routledge.

Seixas, P., Morton, T. (2013). *The big six: historical thinking concepts.* Kanada: Nelson Education.

Seixas, P. (2006). *Benchmarks of historical thinking: A framework for assessment in Canada.* Ministry of Education, Government of British Columbia.

Seixas, P., & Peck, C. (2004). Teaching historical thinking. In A. Sears & I. Wright (Eds.), *Challenges and Prospects for Canadian Social Studies (pp. 109-117).* Vancouver: Pacific Educational Press.

Seixas, P. (1998). Student teachers thinking historically. *Theory & Research in Social Education, 26(3),* 310-341. https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.1998.10505854

Seixas, P. (1997). Mapping the terrain of historical significance. *Social Education, 61(1),* 22-27. Retrieved from https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ540240

Seixas, P. (1996). Conceptualizing the growth of historical understanding. In: David R.Olson & N. Torrance (Eds.). *The handbook of education and human development.* (pp. 765-783). Oxford Blackwell Publishers.

Seixas, P. (1994). Students' understanding of historical significance. *Theory & Research in Social Education, 22(3),* 281-304. https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.1994.10505726

Seixas, P. (1993). Historical understanding among adolescents in a multicultural setting. *Curriculum Inquiry, 23(3),* 301. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.2307/1179994

Shemilt, D. (1987). The history curriculum for teachers. In C. Portal (Ed.), *The history curriculum for teachers* (pp. 39-61). London, UK: Falmer Press

Sleeter, C. E., & Grant, C. A. (2011). *Race, class, gender, and disability in the classroom.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Şimşek, A. (2006). *İlköğretim öğrencilerinde tarihsel zaman kavraminin gelişimi ve öğretimi* [Development and teaching of historical time concept in primary school students]. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Gazi Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Ankara.

Şimşek, A. (2012). İlköğretim öğrencilerinde tarihsel zaman ve kronoloji becerileri [Historical time and chronological skills in primary school students] In M. Safran. (Ed.), *Sosyal bilgiler öğretimi [Social Studies Education].* (ss. 93-117). Pegem.

Yıldırım, A., & Şimşek, H. (2013). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştirma yöntemleri [Qualitative research methods in social sciences].* Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.

Thornton, S. J. (2005). *Teaching social studies that matters: Curriculum for active learning.* Teachers College Press.

Torpey, J. (2006). *Making whole what has been smashed: on reparations politics*. Harvard University Press.

Tosh, J. (2015). *The pursuit of history* (6th ed.). Routledge, London.

VanSledright, B. A. (2011). *The challenge of rethinking history education: On practices, theories, and policy.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Weber, R.P. (1990). *Basic content analysis, quantitative applications in the social sciences,* Sage Publications, Inc.

Wineburg, S. (2001). *Historical thinking and other unnatural acts: Charting the future of teaching the past.* Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.

The Authors' Biographies

İsmail Hakkı Demircioğlu, Born in Of, Prof. Dr. İsmail Hakkı Demircioğlu completed his primary and secondary education in Gülderen and high school education in Hayrat High School. Demircioğlu received his bachelor's degree from Atatürk University and his master's degree from Karadeniz Technical University and completed his doctorate at the University of Birmingham in England. He has published many publications in education and teacher education in Turkey and abroad. He is also an evaluator at the Higher Education Council (YÖK) Quality Board. He was the founding dean of the Gendarmerie and Coast Guard Academy and currently serves as the Dean of Trabzon University Fatih Faculty of Education. He is married and has two children. His foreign language is English.

İnanç Genç, He was born in 1987 in Şavşat district of Artvin province. In 2011, he graduated with a degree from Atatürk University, Kâzım Karabekir Faculty of Education, Department of History Teaching. In 2014, he started his academic life as a Research Assistant at Karadeniz Technical University. In 2016, she started her academic life as a research assistant at Karadeniz Technical University, Department of Secondary Social Studies Education, titled "Evaluation of Teaching Strategies Used by History Practice Teachers: The Opinions of History Teacher Candidates" at Karadeniz Technical University. In 2016, he was appointed an Education Specialist to the Turkish Employment Agency. As of January 2024, he has served as an Education Specialist at the Trabzon Regional Directorate of the Presidency of the Republic of Turkey Directorate of Communication. In

2017, he started his doctorate at Kastamonu University Institute of Social Sciences, Department of Social Studies Education. He continues his studies in scientific research and publication ethics and is currently writing his doctoral thesis. He has articles in indexed journals in the fields of History Education, Social Studies Teaching, Teacher Training, Values Education, Academic Ethics, scientific research and publication ethics, and papers presented at international conferences. In addition, he is a member of the Eurasian Association of Social Sciences Educators Association and continues to work for social benefit. He is married and has one child. His foreign language is English.

Selahaddin Kaymakcı, he was born in 1981 in Tosya district of Kastamonu province. In 2003, he graduated from Karade-niz Technical University (KTU), Fatih Faculty of Education, Department of Primary Education, Social Studies Teaching Program with first place. In 2006, he completed his master's degree in KTU, Institute of Social Sciences, Secondary Social Studies Education, History Teaching Program with his thesis titled "History Teachers' Opinions on Worksheets". The same year, he enrolled in Gazi University, Institute of Educational Sciences, Department of Primary Education, Department of Social Studies Education, PhD program. He won the doctoral research scholarship of YÖK and carried out his research activities at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign in the United States between 2009-2010. In 2010, he completed his doctoral education with his thesis titled "The Effect of Using Worksheets in Social Studies Teaching on Students' Academic Achievement and Attitudes Towards the Course". She started her professional career in 2004 by being appointed as a research assistant at KTU, Fatih Faculty of Education. He continued his career at the same university as an assistant professor in 2011 and as an associate professor in 2014. In 2015, he transferred to Kastamonu University (KÜ), Faculty of Education, Department of Social Studies Education. In 2019, he received the title of professor in the same department. He became the first academician in Turkey to graduate from undergraduate social studies education and receive his associate professorship and professorship in the same field. He assumed administrative duties such as Dean of KÜ Faculty of Education, Director of Tosya Vocational School, Director of the Child Education Application and Research Center, Head of the Social Studies Education Department, and ÖSYM Tos-ya District Exam Coordinator. He has worked on various international and national social studies, history, and life science education projects and has many works. He works at Kastamonu University, Faculty of Education, Department of Turkish and Social Sciences Education, Department of Social Studies Education. He is married and has two children. His foreign language is English.